

Student X

Dr. Denton

EDUC 302

Case Study

11 October 2011

Case Study for Upperclassmen High School Students

In a high school English III class, an end of the year research paper is assigned that is worth 30% of the overall course grade. Carrie knows that she is strong in reading but very weak at writing. She's trying to get into good universities so she can eventually get into medical school and she knows that this research paper will bring down her GPA and possibly prevent her from attending the school she wants. A friend of hers, Lisa, that is already in college offered to give Carrie one of the research papers she had to do in college. Lisa received an A on the paper at the college level, so Carrie knows she could get an A on it in high school, which would help boost her GPA for college applications, so Carrie accepts. Carrie has every intention of changing a few words to make the paper sound more like her work, so it's not entirely Lisa's work. Carrie didn't steal the paper Lisa simply offered it to her. Should Carrie have done that? Why or why not?

Responses

Level 1: Pre-Conventional Morality

Stage 1: Obedience and Punishment Orientation

Answers:

- Solution one: Carrie is wrong to steal the paper because if she were to get caught by her teacher she would be punished severely. She would fail the paper, lose 30% on her overall grade in the class, and face further consequences determined by her teacher.
- Solution two: Lisa is wrong to let Carrie use her paper. Carrie needs to do her own work because if Carrie were to get caught then so would Lisa. Carrie's teacher could turn in Lisa at her college and get her punished for helping plagiarize a paper.

Why: These answer belong under the obedience and punishment orientation stage because the answers focuses only on the consequences that would occur if Carrie and Lisa got caught.

Stage 2: Individualism and Exchange

Answers:

- Solution one: Carrie might think that using her friend's paper is fine since she gave permission.
- Solution two: Lisa may think this is acceptable because it's helping a friend who is not in college with her.
- Solution three: The teacher would not think that copying the paper is acceptable because Carrie should do her own work.

Why: These answers are stage 2 answers because they consider only what each individual would think. Neither one focuses on family or society, just the individuals involved in the situation.

Level 2: Conventional Morality

Stage 3: Good Interpersonal Relationships

Answer:

- Solution one: Carrie is wrong to steal the paper because she is only thinking of herself. If she were to get caught with plagiarizing a paper, she would not only jeopardize her grade, but possibly Lisa's school career as well. Her only thought was getting a good grade on the paper and didn't consider her friend's security first.
- Solution two: Lisa is in the wrong for allowing Carrie to use her paper. Her intentions were good to help out a friend in need, but she should've helped Carrie write her own paper instead of having her use her old paper.

Why: These answers belong in the third stage of Good Interpersonal Relationships because both answers consider feelings of empathy by Lisa and trust by both girls. Friendships are being worked in because Lisa just wanted to help Carrie and Carrie was being selfish and not thinking about Lisa and endangering her friend.

Stage 4: Maintaining the Social Order

Answers:

- Solution one: Carrie was wrong for taking Lisa's paper. Although she wasn't trying to be a bad student and didn't take the paper without permission, it still was not her own work even if she did make a few changes. Most schools

have a policy against taking other's work and Carrie broke this rule. If everyone in the school used each other's work, everything in the world would be copied from someone else and no source could be trusted anymore.

- Solution two: Lisa is in the wrong for letting Carrie use her paper. Although her intentions were good to help out a friend, it's against most university policies to plagiarize. Even though it's her work, she should have just helped Carrie write a paper instead of letting her cheat her way through her final paper. If everyone allowed friends to use their own work, nobody would think for himself or herself anymore and the world would be a complicated place to live in.

Why: These answer belong in the fourth stage because they both side with the rule that both girls broke. Society is also factored into the answers. Both solutions consider what the world would be like if everyone behaved like Lisa and Carrie.

Level 3: Post-Conventional Morality

Stage 5: Social Contract and Individual Rights

Answers:

- Solution one: Carrie is still in the wrong. Even though she was just trying to do what was best for her future, her way of approaching this goal was completely wrong. In no way does her behavior reflect how society should function. Carrie needs to do her own work.
- Solution two: Lisa is still in the wrong. Even though she was being a good friend, and she was considering her friend over herself, which is a good

quality to have, she was encouraging wrong actions that aren't acceptable for society to function on.

Why: These answers belong under the fifth stage because they consider whether or not the rule is important, and conclude that it is. They think about what is socially acceptable and if this is a good way to have society function.